

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 N 2608

Date: 2015-02-11

REPLACES: —

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32

Data Management and Interchange

Secretariat: United States of America (ANSI)
Administered by Farance Inc. on behalf of ANSI

DOCUMENT TYPE	Disposition of Comments
TITLE	Disposition of comments on N2465 DIS 15944-9 Information technology - Business operational view Part 9: Business transaction traceability framework for commitment exchange
SOURCE	WG1 - Wenfeng Sun - project editor
PROJECT NUMBER	1.32.31.01.09.00
STATUS	Disposition of the comments in 32N2540 Summary of Voting on 32N2465 DIS 15944-9 ballot text. this DoC accompanies 32N2607 text for FDIS ballot by ITTF
REFERENCES	
ACTION ID.	FYI
REQUESTED ACTION	
DUE DATE	--
Number of Pages	20
LANGUAGE USED	English
DISTRIBUTION	P & L Members SC Chair WG Conveners and Secretaries

Dr. Timothy Schoechle, Secretary, ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32
Farance Inc *, 3066 Sixth Street, Boulder, CO, United States of America
Telephone: +1 303-443-5490; E-mail: Timothy@Schoechle.org
available from the JTC 1/SC 32 WebSite <http://www.jtc1sc32.org/>
*Farance Inc. administers the ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 Secretariat on behalf of ANSI

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
CA01	35-161	Contents	all	ed	The Table of Contents (ToC) is missing entries for Clauses at the 4 th level of granularity as found in the document. For example, entries in the ToC are missing for: 6.3.5.1 General requirements on business events 6.3.5.2 Requirements on temporal referencing or location referencing 6	Project Editor (PE) requested to check and correct	Accepted
CA02	35-170	Contents	all	ed	There should be a space/line in the ToC between each main Clause and Annex, (e.g., at lines 43-44 between “0.6 and “1 Introduction”; lines 76-77 between “6.3.4 and “7”, etc.). The same applies for each Annex, (e.g., between “A.5” and “Annex B”	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA03	25-36	all	all	ed	The page numbering is off in the ToC and the entry for Foreword is missing. It should be page “iii “	PE requested to check and correct	Accepted
CA04	162-170	Contents	all	ed	There should not be a page break between the entry in the ToC between “List of Figures” and Tables”. Further, lines 162-164 should be deleted.	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA05	212	0.1		ed	Based on the normative Clauses in this Part 9 ballot document, it appears that the following informative text is missing, at the end of line 212 “as well as the goal, i.e., nature of the business transaction”.	PE requested to insert	Accepted
CA06	259-260	0.3		ed	The start of text in line 260 should be indented to that where “Part” starts in line 259.	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA07	328	0.4		ed	Based on the normative text in this document, it appears that associated implied informative text is missing. It should be made explicit. The recommendation is to add the following text after “...non-conformance”; namely:	PE requested to insert	Accepted

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					“..with applicable legal/regulatory requirements pertaining to the goal of the business transaction”...		
CA08	329	0.4		ed	A business transaction pertains to a “product, service and/or right”. Amend the “...products” to read: “...products, services and/or rights”. This is implied, if not explicitly stated in lines 321-353 which follow.	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA09	374-376	0.6		ed	While it is understood as to what is intended, the wording in line 375 needs to be made more readable. Change text in line 375 to read: “...for the first time, i.e., are not already found in the existing Parts of ISO/IEC 15944 as well as ISO/IEC 14662.” (These terms and definitions for these new concepts are to be included in the next edition of ISO/IEC 15944-7 “ <i>eBusiness</i> ” vocabulary.	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA10	379	0.6		ed	Clarity in wording. Change “... date/time-based to read: “...date/time-based referencing”.	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA11	385	0.6		ed	Need to link requirements on business locations to jurisdictional domain(S) of the same. Change text at the end of line 385 from “...of stating business locations”. To “...of jurisdictional domain(s) for stating business locations”.	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA12	392-393	0.6		ed	Need to differentiate between ISO and ISO/IEC international standards relevant to Part 9 which serve as Normative References and those which do not but are still relevant and as such are cited in the Bibliography. Change “...standards and other relevant documents” to read: “...standards (Which are not used as Normative References in Clause 2) and, other relevant documents...”	PE requested to apply	Accepted

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
CA13	404	1.1		ed	Clarity in wording. Change current text in line 404 from "...due to laws, regulations, policies, etc., from various jurisdictional domains and that needs to be..." to read: "...due to applicable laws, regulations, policies, etc., of jurisdictional domains which need to be ..."	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA14	406	1.1		ed	Clarity in wording. Change current text in line 406 "...those external constraints but also apply as internal constraints by the mutual agreements of parties to a business transaction" to read as follows: "...external constraints. However, parties to a business transaction may well by mutual agreement apply external constraints of this nature as internal constraints by mutual agreement"...	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA15	441-444	1.2.2		ed	Repeat of use of "Therefore" to start sentence in line 441 and 444. It is suggested to move start of line 441 to end of line 440. Start next paragraph with sentence in line 442 starting with "The Open-edi Reference Model".	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA16	464	1.3		ed	Clarity of wording. Change the text in line 464 which currently reads "...of resources of the technical input..." to "of resources at this time, the technical input..."	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA17	469	1.3		Ed	Consistency with text in Clause 1.3 "Aspects not currently addressed". Add sentence at line 469 to read "The aspects are expected to be addressed in a future edition of this Part or another (new) Part of ISO/IEC 15944".	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA18	474-499	2		Ed	It is necessary to verify the dates of the standards referenced and bring them up-to-date at the time of the preparation of the FDIS ballot document. For example, it is likely that the reference for ISO/IEC 15944-4 will be 2014 instead of 2007.	PE requested to verify dates at FDIS preparation stage for entries in Clause 2.	Accepted

¹ **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
CA19	504- 1240	3		ed	Any changes to dates of Normative References (See CA18) will also necessitate to changes in date to use of that standard in one or more entries in Clause 3.	PE requested to implement in preparation of FDIS ballot document.	Accepted
CA20	930	3.5.3		Ed	No reference is found in Clause 2 or the Bibliography for ISO 22745-2:201. It is recommended that the complete title for this ISO standard be added to the Bibliography.	PE requested to insert the following to bibliography <i>ISO 22745-2:2010 Industrial automation systems and integration -- Open technical dictionaries and their application to master data -- Part 2: Vocabulary</i>	Accepted
CA21	1274	5.1		Ed	Insertion of commas. Change current text "...principles emerged from external constraints may also..." to "...principles, emerged from external constraints, may address..."/	PE requested to consider and apply	Accepted
CA22	1313	5.2		Ed	The "Rule" on line 1313 reads "nn". It should be numbered as Rule 01, as the first Rule in Part 9, which it appears to be. Number Rule "nn" at line 1373 as "Rule 01" and re-number all Rules (and Guidelines) in Part 9 accordingly.	PE requested to verify and apply.	Accepted
CA23	1331	5.3.1		Ed	The current text in line 1331 which reads "...detailed sets of recorded information by..." should be changed to "...detailed sets of recorded information (SRIs) by...".	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA24	1343	5.3.2		Ed	Missing word. The text in line 1343 reads "...include but not limited to:". Change to "...include but are not limited to".	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA25	1344	5.3.2		Ed	Clarification. Change the current text in line 1344 which reads "...for Persons and personae with..." to "...for Persons and their personae with..."	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA26	1346	5.3.2		Ed	Use of acronym BTE. It would be useful to include the acronym "BTE" in line 1346 so that it reads "...of business transaction entities" (BTEs), including..."	PE requested to consider and apply here and elsewhere in the Part 9, especially where the acronym "BTE" should be used instead of the full text.	Accepted

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
CA27	1361	5.3.3		Ed	Readability. Change current text in line 1361 "...among parties, however all..." to read: "...among parties. However, all..."	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA28	1377- 1378	5.3.4		Ed	Readability. Canada supports that Rule in lines 1377-1378 but recommends that its text be improved to read as follows: "All traceability commitments shall be predefined, as well as their associated labels of granularity, and shall be decided and agreed upon by the parties to the business transaction".	PE requested consider and to apply	Accepted
CA29	1388	5.3.5		Ed	Clarity. Change the current text in line 1388 which reads "Every party may decide..." to "Every party, to an instantiated business transaction, can decide..." It is assumed that this is what is intended.	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA30	1406- 1407	5.4		Ed	Readability and clarity. The understood purpose and intention of the text in lines 1406-1407 should be improved so that it reads as follows: "The basic objective is to ensure that the information about the good, service, and/or right pertaining to an instantiated business either is available (or readily available) either about its history..."	PE requested to consider and to apply	Accepted
CA31	1422- 1423	6.1		Ed	1. Clarity. Need to highlight difference between "traceability" and "non-traceable" commitments. Current text in lines 1422-1423 reads as follows: <i>"When traceability needs to be supported by a scenario, commitment shall be considered as traceable commitment and non-traceable commitment".</i> Consider the following revised text. "When traceability needs to be supported	PE requested to consider and advise.	Accepted Change the text to "When traceability needs to be supported by a scenario, the set of commitments pertaining to that scenario should be considered as either (a) a traceable commitment; or (b) a non-traceable commitment."

¹ **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					<p>by a scenario, the set of commitments pertaining to that scenario shall be considered as either (a) a traceable commitment; or (b) a non-traceable commitment.”</p> <p>2. Since the sentence in lines 1422-1423 contains a “shall”, it reads more like a rule. Consideration should be given to converting it into a rule.</p>		
CA32	1424	6.1		Ed	Change “...entities other then...” to “entities other than...”	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA33	1425-1429	6.1		Ed	Readability. Lines 1425-1428 consist of a single (too long) sentence.	PE requested to parse the single long sentence into two (or three) shorter sentences. To be presented and discussed by SC32/WG1 at the CRM.	Accepted Change the text to: “In this Part of ISO/IEC 15944, these are called non-commitment entities which include Person, business event, and non-commitment item. The non-commitment entities do not belong to commitment, Person or business event in a business transaction, but should be considered in support of the traceability requirements.”
CA34	1443	6.2.1		Ed	Change “Parities” to “Parties”	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA35	1467	6.2.2		Ed	Consider changing text in line 1467 from “As specified in Clause 3,…” to “As defined in Clause 3,…”	PE requested consider and to apply	Accepted
CA36	1467	6.2.2		Ed	Use of singular or plural, i.e., need to allow for both. Consider changing “traceability data is SRI about traceability commitments…” to “traceability data pertains to SRI(s) about	PE requested to consider and apply	Accepted

¹ **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					traceability commitments..."		
CA37	1471	6.2.2		Ed	Use of singular or plural, i.e., need to allow for both. Change "The SRI..." to "The SRI(s)..."	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA38	1507	6.2.2		Ed	Use of singular or plural, i.e., need to allow for both. Consider changing "The SRI..." to "The SRI(s)..."	PE requested to consider and apply	Accepted
CA39	1513	6.2.2		Ed	It is assumed that the options are not mutually exclusive. Change current text from "...application or location..." to "...application and/or location..."	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA40	1513	6.2.2		Ed	It is important to state explicitly that one has options. Therefore use of "and/or" instead of "and" appears to be more appropriate. Change current text of "...history, application or location..." to "history, application, and/or location..."	PE requested to consider and advise SC32/WG1 to implement or not	Accepted
CA41	1514	6.2.2		Ed	Apply resolution of CA37 to similar text in line 1514	PE requested to consider and advise SC32/WG1 to implement or not	Accepted Change event to business event
CA42	1514- 1516	6.2.2		Ed	Clarity. It is recommended that text be added at the end of line 1516 to improve clarity (and use) of the current text in lines 1514-1516 in support of Rule 11. Change "...that is needed" to "...that is needed, i.e., as IB(s) and/or SC(s) in support of an Open-edi scenario which supports traceability requirements".	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA43	1518	6.3.1		Ed	Minor edit. Change "...application" to "applications"; and, "...consist" to "consisting".	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA44	1529	6.3.1		Ed	"Identification" is a defined concept (See Part 1, 3.26). There is a need to re-phrase line 1529 to read "In a traceability context, identification	PE requested to apply	Accepted

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					serves as the mapping....”		
CA45	1601	6.3.2		Ed	There seems to be a “Word” missing in line 1601 in the text “...identifiers for individual specified by a ...”	PE requested to review and correct.	Accepted
CA46	1631- 1635	6.3.2		Ed	Right-side boxes in Figure 7. Consistency in sue of parent boxes and text. Recommended that text for top box become “Traceable commitments (BTEs that need to be changed)” and for the bottom box “Non-traceable commitments (BTEs that do not need to be traced”).	PE requested consider and to apply	Accepted
CA47	1648	6.3.3		Ed	The possibility should be an option which is what is intended to be stated. Change “However, the traceable...” to “However, at times, the traceable...”	PE requested consider and to apply	Accepted
CA48	1664	6.3.4		Ed	Clarity. Change “...together with persona” to “...together with the persona used by the Person...”	PE requested consider and to apply	Accepted
CA49	1671	6.3.4		Ed	Part of the text is a title of a Clause. It should be presented in italics as “ <i>Identification of Person and persona</i> ”	PE requested consider and to apply	Accepted
CA50	1676	6.3.4		Ed	The current text in line 1676 seems to indicate that Annex D in Part 1 is very comprehensive. It is not. Suggested modified text is “Key identification schemas for Person generally accepted.... (As well as individual, organization and public administrations specifically) are described.	PE requested consider and to apply	Accepted
CA51	1680	6.3.5		Ed	Change “...applications, business events...” to “...applications. Business events...”.	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA52	1687	6.3.7		Ed	Identify Figure. Change “Figure n” to “Figure 8”.	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA53	1694- 1694	6.3.5.1		ed	If the purpose of the text is to distinguish between two types of business events, this would be better served by the following minor edits and resulting text as “...two types of business events; namely,	PE requested to apply	Accepted

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15

Document:

Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					(a) the instantaneous business event; and, (b) the duration business event”..		
CA54	1718 and 1720	6.3.5.2		Ed	In lines 1718 and 1720 change “time” to “temporal referencing”. This is because temporal referencing includes both date and time.	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA55	1769	7.3.1		Ed	Readability. Change “be accounted for...” to “be held accountable for...”.	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA56	1773	7.3.1		Ed	Consider changing “...it is illegal...” to “... it may be illegal...”.	PE requested to consider and to apply	Accepted
CA57	1777	7.3.1		Ed	Repeated use of “Certain”. Change “...to use a certain Person identity...” to “...to use a particular Person identity...”.	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA58	1813	7.3.4		Ed	Missing words. Change “... individual deems to be irrelevant...” to “...individual deems such personal information to be irrelevant...”	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA59	1892	7.5.5		Ed	Wording of title of Clause in line 1892. The current title is “Traceability data unambiguousness”. Perhaps a more readable title would be “Unambiguous traceability data”.	PE requested to consider and to apply	Accepted
CA60	1909	7.5.6		Ed	Change “legible” to “eligible”	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA61	1961- 1983	8.2		Ed	The figure 9 is “superimposed” over the text making both not readable. Recommend inserting a “page break” after line 1961 (or 1962) so that the complete Figure 9 is moved to the top of the next page.	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA62	2016- 2017	9		Ed	It is important that the indication of the use of the asterisk in Table 1 be more visible. Change text in lines 2016-2017 to read “Those entries marked with an asterisk, i.e., “*”, are the attributes for Open-edi scenario scoping added in support of traceability requirements of this Part 9 of ISO/IEC 15944.	PE requested to consider and to apply	Accepted
CA63	2016- 2018	9		ed	1. While these lines for Part 9 reference Part 1 (and correctly so) some information is missing, namely what the decision codes are; and, the fact that this is a Clause which should be titled “ <i>Template for identifying</i>	PE to review, consider and requested to implement.	Accepted For entry 4, it is in 9.2

¹ **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

MB/NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/Figure/Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					<p><i>traceability requirements for scoping of Open-edi scenarios.”</i></p> <p>2. Recommend that the structure and Clauses for this Clause 9 be similar in nature to that found in Clause 12 Part 5 (and Clause 8 in Part 8) as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 9.1 Introduction and basic principles - 9.2 Template structure and contents - 9.3 Template for specifying the scope of an Open-edi scenario –traceability requirements perspective <p>3. This would also include incorporating the associated rules and placing them in a Part 9 context.</p> <p>4. Finally, it needs to be made clear that the template identifies only the “mandatory” decision codes for scoping Open-edi scenarios from a traceability requirements perspective. The completion of the decision codes for the other Open-edi scenario attributes are to be completed when one uses the template to scope an Open-edi scenario for a specified context. Note: This has always been implied, it should be stated explicitly as part of the text for Clause 9.3, i.e., as a “rule”.</p>		
CA64	2019-2020	Clause 9		ed	<p>The Applicable “Decision Codes” for the Clause 9 Template need to be (re-)entered. Based on our participation in the development of the CD1-CD3 Part 9 ballot documents and our comments, we believe that these are as follows:</p> <p>Scope Tag Decision ID code Code</p>	PE requested to verify and implement.	Accepted

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					1010 1 1040 1 1041 1 1042 1 1043 1 1044 1 1045 1 1046 1 1060 1 1061 1 1065 1 1066 1 1081 1 1086 1 1132 1 1181 1 1182 1 1191 1 1192 1 1200 1 1225 1 1250 1 1255 1 1260 1 1265 1 1270 1 1405 1 1410 1 1415 1 1420 1 1501 1 1520 1 1525 1 1600 ?		
CA65	2096	Annex B		Ed	Re: footnote 35 shading. Remove “shading”. Verify if there is not a more recent version than 2007.	PE requested to apply	Accepted
CA66	2598-	Annex F.1		Ed	In Figure F.1, the text in the two left (middle row) of boxes is missing. This needs to be (re-	PE requested to apply	Accepted

¹ **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
	2607				entered).		
CA67	2622	Annex F.2		ed	The reference is to a "Figure 10". Should this not be "Figure F.2"?	PE requested to correct.	Accepted
CA68	2637	Annex F.2		Ed	The reference is to "Figure 13". Should this not be "Figure F.3"?	PE requested to correct.	Accepted
CA69	2678	Annex G		Ed	Change "...to strength..." to "strengthen..."	PE requested to apply	Accepted
JP01	35	Contents		ed	There are "Forward" and "Bibliography" missing from contents pages.	To add them into contents pages.	Accepted
JP02	116	Contents		ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.6.4.5 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP03	247	0.2	6th paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 7.1 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP04	258, (271)	0.2	2nd footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 0.5 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP05	278, (299)	0.3	3rd footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 5.4 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP06	355	0.5	1st paragraph	ed	There are inadequate words as "clause" because 5.1 and 6.1.2 are subordinate clause numbers.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP07	359	0.5	2nd paragraph	te	Conformance of this part is unclear because there is no sentences explaining "the conformance to the rules of ..."	To add explaining sentences for conformance of this part.	Noted Resolved by adding the following text at the end of 0.4. "For example, business analyser(s) and/or system designer(s) should consider and/or incorporate the rules stated in this Part of ISO/IEC 15944 in developing the architecture"

¹ **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
							of business transaction. The incorporation of these rules can be done either by understanding and adopting the requirements reflected in these rules, or by transforming these rules into IT-enabled format and integrating them in the system configuration"
JP08	364	0.6	1st paragraph	ed	Close 5, 6, 7, 8 and 9 are normative.	To change "The remaining five normative clauses of this document are as follows:" to "The remaining five clauses of this document are normative and as follows:"	Accept
JP09	379	0.6	9th paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.6.4.5 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted as per the current ISO directives, Part 2 (See 6.6.7.3)
JP10	474	2	2nd paragraph	ed	There is no "shall" sentence as normatively referred to ISO 1087-1 that is listed in normative references.	To delete a reference of ISO 1087-1 from normative references or add "shall" sentences referred to ISO 1087-1.	Accepted
JP11	476	2	3rd paragraph	ed	There is no "shall" sentence as normatively referred to ISO 5127 that is listed in normative references.	To delete a reference of ISO 5127 from normative references or add "shall" sentences referred to ISO 5127.	Accepted
JP12	477	2	4th paragraph	ed	There is no "shall" sentence as normatively referred to ISO/IEC 6523-1 that is listed in normative references.	To delete a reference of ISO/IEC 6523-1 from normative references or add "shall" sentences referred to ISO/IEC 6523-1.	Accepted
JP13	482, 483	2	7th and 8th paragraph	ed	There is no "shall" sentence as normatively referred to ISO/IEC 11179-1/3 that are listed in normative references.	To delete references of ISO/IEC 11179-1/3 from normative references or add "shall" sentences referred to ISO/IEC 11179-1/3.	Accepted
JP14	486	2	10th paragraph	ed	There is no "shall" sentence as normatively referred to ISO/IEC 15489-1 that is listed in normative references.	To delete a reference of ISO/IEC 15489-1 from normative references or add "shall" sentences referred to ISO/IEC 15489-1.	Accepted
JP15	489, 491,	2	12th, 13th, 15th and	ed	There is no "shall" sentence as normatively referred to ISO/IEC 15944-2/4/7/8 that are listed	To delete references of ISO/IEC 15944-2/4/7/8 from normative references or add "shall" sentences referred to ISO/IEC 15944-2/4/7/8.	Accepted

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15

Document:

Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
	495, 496		16th paragraph		in normative references.		
JP16	498	2	17th paragraph	ed	There is no "shall" sentence as normatively referred to ISO 19115 that is listed in normative references.	To delete a reference of ISO 19115 from normative references or add "shall" sentences referred to ISO 19115.	Accepted
JP17	499	2	18th paragraph	ed	There is no "shall" sentence as normatively referred to ISO 19135 that is listed in normative references.	To delete a reference of ISO 19135 from normative references or add "shall" sentences referred to ISO 19135.	Accepted
JP18	689	3.23	2nd paragraph	ed	There is an unnecessary article as "a" at the beginning of a phrase.	To delete an article as "a".	Accepted
JP19	924	3.53	2nd paragraph	ed	There is an unnecessary period at the end of a phrase.	To delete a period at the end of phrase.	Accepted
JP20	1031	3.69	2nd paragraph	ed	There is an unnecessary article as "a" at the beginning of a phrase.	To delete an article as "a".	Accepted
JP21	1097	3.78	3rd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.3 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP22	1136	3.82	3rd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.2.7 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP23	1287	5.2	10th paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 5.1 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP24	1313	5.2 (2)	2nd paragraph	ed	There is an unnumbered rule.	To renumber all rules.	Accepted
JP25	1344, (1372)	5.3.2	11th footnote	ed	There are inadequate words as "clause" because 6.2 and 7.3 are subordinate clause numbers.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP26	1345, (1372)	5.3.2	12th footnote	ed	There are inadequate words as "clause" because 6.6.4.4 and 7.5.4 are subordinate clause numbers.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP27	1393	5.3.5	3rd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.4.6 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP28	1412	6.2.2	6th	ed	Figure 9 collapses.	To update it to a good figure.	Accepted

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
			paragraph				
JP29	1546	6.3.2	1st paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 5.3.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP30	1665	6.3.4	3rd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 5.1 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP31	1671	6.2.3	3rd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because two numbers as 6.2.3 are subordinate clause numbers.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP32	1736	6.3.5.3	4th paragraph	ed	Annex D is unsuitable reference because it is an informative annex and refers Annex D and Annex E in Part 5 of ISO/IEC 15944.	To change "Annex D" to "Annex D and Annex E of ISO/IEC 15944-5".	Accepted
JP33	1754, (1779)	7.2.1	17th footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.3 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP34	1778	7.3.1	3rd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.2.3 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP35	1795	7.3.3	3rd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because D.5.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP36	1880	7.5.3	3rd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.6.4.3 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP37	1888	7.5.4	3rd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.6.4.4 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP38	1889	7.5.4	3rd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 5.3.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP39	1940, (1983)	8.1	18th footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 5.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP40	1943	8.1	2nd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP41	1955	8.2	1st paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 5.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
JP42	1983	8.2	Table 9	ed	Letters of Figure 9 is too small that it is hard to read them.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP43	1985	8.3	1st paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 5.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP44	2005	8.3	2nd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 0.3 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP45	2006	8.3	2nd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.1.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP46	2010	8.3	3rd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.4 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP47	2016	9	2nd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 7.3.1 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP48	2019	9	Table 1	ed	There is a multi-page table as Table 1. However, a first page of table has a title only.	To add a title as "Table 1 (Continued)" to 2nd and following pages of table.	Accepted
JP49	2019	9	21st footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 8.4.2.5 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP50	2019	9	22nd footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 8.4.2.5 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP51	2019	9	23rd footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.6.4.5 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP52	2019	9	25th footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.6.4.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP53	2019	9	26th footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.6.4.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP54	2019	9	26th footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.6.4.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP55	2019	9	27th footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.6.4.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP56	2019	9	28th footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted

¹ **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					6.6.4.3 is a subordinate clause number.		
JP57	2019	9	29th footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.6.4.3 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP58	2019	9	30th footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.5.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP59	2066	A.4	Table A.1	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 5.3.6 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP60	2071	A.4	3rd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 5.3.4 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP61	2085	A.5	Table A.2	ed	There is a multi-page table as Table A.2. However, a first page of table has a title only.	To add a title as "Table A.2 (Continued)" to 2nd and following pages of table.	Accepted
JP62	2102	B.1	3rd paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because B.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP63	2106	B.1	4th paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because B.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP64	2101	B.1	5th paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because B.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP65	2278	C.1	1st paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 8.3.5 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP66	2287	C.2	title	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.6.4.5 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP67	2288	C.2	1st paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.6.4.5 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP68	2306	C.2	5th paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 6.3 and 6.6.4.2 are subordinate clause numbers.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP69	2300, (2308)	C.2	36th footnote	ed	There are inadequate words as "clause" because 8.4.5, 8.4.6 and 8.4.7 are subordinate clause numbers.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted
JP70	2332,	C.2	38th footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as "clause" because 5.3.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as "Clause".	Accepted

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
	(2338)						
JP71	2356, (2370)	C.2	44th footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as “clause” because 4.1 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as “Clause”.	Accepted
JP72	2357, (2370)	C.2	45th footnote	ed	There is an inadequate word as “clause” because 4.2 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as “Clause”.	Accepted
JP73	2390	D.2	1st paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as “clause” because D.4.1.1 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as “Clause”.	Accepted
JP74	2397, (2398)	D.2	49th footnote	ed	There are inadequate words as “clause” because 5.2 and 5.3 are subordinate clause numbers.	To delete a word as “Clause”.	Accepted
JP75	2406	D.2	9th paragraph	ed	There is an inadequate word as “clause” because 5.5 is a subordinate clause number.	To delete a word as “Clause”.	Accepted
GB	all	all		ge	<p>The UK votes for refusal unless UK comments are accepted when the vote will be for approval.</p> <p>The UK has taken advantage of reviewing the editorial comments and proposals of Canada and recommends them for acceptance. Since those changes are extensive, the UK does not propose to reproduce them in full in this document but wishes them to be taken as read,</p>		Accepted
GB	216			ed	(for the latter at times mandatory) may be difficult to translate.	This may be a mandatory process invoked by the power of the regulator.	Accepted
GB	464- 465			ed	“However, due to the lack of resources of the technical input from IATA these requirements are not incorporated....” is unclear.	However, due to the lack of resources or the technical input from IATA at the time of this standard, such requirements were not incorporated...”	Accepted
GB	1302-3			ed	“need to follow and have evidence in place to allow traceability to occur” needs clarification	“need to follow documented processes that provide the evidence needed to prove traceability”	Accepted

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2014-07-15	Document:	Project: ISO/IEC DIS 15944-9
------------------	-----------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
GB	1617			ed	“The widely recognized existing” is not grammatical.	“The most widely recognized existing”	Accepted
GB	1620			ed	Repeat UK04		Accepted
GB	1640			ed	“to the packaging of product.” Is clumsy	“to product packaging.”	Accepted
GB	1641-2			ed	“since it is always the practice that the product be recalled is only package of product that has the defect.” Is clumsy	“since it is often the case that products are recalled because of packaging defects rather than product defects.”	Accepted

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial