

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 N 2340

Date: 2013-04-29

REPLACES: —

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32

Data Management and Interchange

Secretariat: United States of America (ANSI)
Administered by Farance Inc. on behalf of ANSI

DOCUMENT TYPE	Summary of Voting/Table of Replies
TITLE	Summary of Voting on 32N2301 ISO/IEC CD2 19763-10 Information technology - Metamodel framework for interoperability (MFI) Part 10: Core model and basic mapping
SOURCE	SC32 Secretariat
PROJECT NUMBER	1.32.22.01.10.00
STATUS	The document did not obtain substantial support. WG2 is requested to address the comments and revise the draft text accordingly.
REFERENCES	
ACTION ID.	ACT
REQUESTED ACTION	
DUE DATE	
Number of Pages	13
LANGUAGE USED	English
DISTRIBUTION	P & L Members SC Chair WG Conveners and Secretaries

Dr. Timothy Schoechle, Secretary, ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32
Farance Inc *, 3066 Sixth Street, Boulder, CO, United States of America
Telephone: +1 303-443-5490; E-mail: Timothy@Schoechle.org
available from the JTC 1/SC 32 WebSite <http://www.jtc1sc32.org/>
*Farance Inc. administers the ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 Secretariat on behalf of ANSI

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 N2340

Summary of Voting on Document SC 32 N 2301

Title: ISO/IEC CD2 19763-10 Information technology - Metamodel framework for interoperability (MFI) Part 10: Core model and basic mapping

Project: 1.32.22.01.10.00

“P” Member	Approval	Approval with Comments	Disapproval with Comments	Abstention with Comments
Canada			1	
China	1			
Czech Republic	1			
Egypt	1			
Finland				1
Germany		1		
India				1
Japan			1	
Korea, Republic of	1			
Portugal				1
Russian Federation	1			
United Kingdom			1	
United States		1		
Total “P”	5	2	3	3
“O” Member				
Austria				
Belgium				
France				1
Ghana				
Hungary				
Indonesia				
Italy				
Kazakhstan				
Netherlands, The				
Norway				
Romania				
Poland				
Sweden				
Switzerland				
Total “O”				

Dr. Timothy Schoechle, Secretary, ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32
Farance Inc *, 3066 Sixth Street, Boulder, CO, United States of America
Telephone: +1 303-443-5490; E-mail: Timothy@Schoechle.org
available from the JTC 1/SC 32 WebSite <http://www.jtc1sc32.org/>

*Farance Inc. administers the ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 32 Secretariat on behalf of ANSI

COMMENTS:

Canada

NO. See comments below:

Finland

ABSTAIN. Lack of expertise and interest.

Germany

YES. See comments below:

India

ABSTAIN. Lack of expertise and interest.

Japan

NO. See comments below:

Portugal

ABSTAIN. Lack of expertise and interest.

United Kingdom

NO. See comments below:

United States

YES. See comments below:

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
CA 00	All	All	-	ge	Canada disapproves of the draft for the reasons below.	Canada will change its vote to Approval if the comments below are satisfactorily addressed.	
CA 01	All	All	-	ge	Since the new template allows for text to be referenced using line numbers, we generated a line numbered version of the text which is attached at the bottom of this document, and we have referenced those line numbers in our comments.	Canada asks that future ballot texts include line numbers so that all NBs can reference them.	
CA 02	143	0 Introduction	Para 2, line 4	Ed	repeated 'for registering'	Remove the duplicate.	
CA 03	160	1 Scope	Para 3, line 1	Ed	'metemodell' should be 'metamodel'	Make the correction.	
CA 04	164	1 Scope	Figure 1	Ed	Three instances of 'specifie' should be 'specifies'.	Make the corrections.	
CA 05	257	5.2	Figure 3	Te	Association Model to Model_Element needs at least 1 cardinality of a Model_Element. Otherwise we do not have a model.	Make the correction.	
CA 06	All	All	All	ge	If any further problems are discovered before or during the Comment Resolution Meeting, and a consensus can be reached on a solution, then they should be corrected.	To be determined at the CRM as required.	

END



32N2301T-text_for_
ballot-CD2_19763-10.

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
DE	1	2	ge	The view on ontologies and their relationship to models is unclear, maybe imprecise. If we denote statistical classifications (e.g. ICD-10) and terminologies (e.g. SNOMED) as ontologies we have to distinguish at least three levels. Firstly, there is an ontology like ICD-10-GM 2013. It is, as it is. It is not a representation of something. Consequently, it is not a model. Secondly, we have a family of ontologies, the ICD or the ICD-10, sharing a common structure, common rules, the domain and the area of application. That could be called a model, but the model does not exist explicitly, because it summarizes different “instances” like ICD-9 WHO 1996, ICD-10 WHO 2006, ICD-10-CA, ICD-10-CM 2012, etc. Thirdly, something like ClaML exists; ClaML is a language able to represent statistical classifications. So, if one is looking for a model of ontologies, ClaML is the most obvious option.	Avoid the phrase “model of ontologies”. Replace that sentence with “.. a metamodel for a registry that can register ontologies and models of a specific type such as process models or ...”.	
DE	1	3	ed	“metemodell” misspelled	Replace with “metamodel”.	
DE	1	Figure 1	ed	“MFI Core and mapping” misspelled	Write consistently “mapping” or “Mapping” in “MFI Core and Mapping” throughout the document.	
DE	1	Figure 1	ed	Missing “s” in “specifie”.	Correct three times.	
DE	1	Figure 1	ed	Abbreviation “E/R model” uncommon.	I suggest “E-R model”.	
DE	5.1	2	ed	Missing “that” in a “basic mapping model allows”.	Replace with “basic mapping model that allows”.	
DE	5.2	Figure 3	ed	The text introduces a self-referencing association for model_element without visualizing that association.	Add the association to figure 3. Alternatively, delete the respective paragraph here (“Each model element uses zero ...”).	
DE	7.2	1	ge	This description should be rephrased according to the first comment on ontologies.	“Model is a metaclass each instance of which represents an ontology or a model that is used to represent information requirements ...”.	

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
JP 01		3.1.3 model element	NOTE	te	Based on their definitions, an event and a service operation do not exist in a process model and in a service model.		
JP 02		5.2 Overview of the Core_Model pacakge	Figure 3	te	Model should be a subclass of Model_Element. Rationale: It cannot not explicitly defined how a Model differs from a Model_Element. It is a kind of Model_Element and depends on the recognition of a Model by its modeller Also see JP04.		
JP 03		5.2 Overview of the Core_Model pacakge	Figure 3	te	Model_Element should be able to be decomposed recursively. Rationale: It is very natural that everything can be decomposed recursively. This recursive decomposition can be used in most of subordinate parts, in addition to Part 5. Also see JP05, 06.		
JP 04		5.2 Overview of the Core_Model pacakge	Figure 4	ed	Figure 4 is overlapped with text. Only in 32N2301T-text_for_ballot-CD2_19763-10.*** doc ***		
JP 05		7.2 Model	Superclass None	te	"None" should be changed to "Model_Element" Also see JP 02.		
JP 06		7.2 Model	Reference contains	te	This reference should be moved to Model_Element Also see JP 03, 06.		
JP 07		7.3 Model_Elem ent	Reference contained_b	te	Class(domain or range) should be changed from Model to Model_Element.		

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
			y		Also see JP 03, 05.		
JP 08	(description)	8.4 Model_Element_Set_Mapping		te	It needs to be clearly defined in this part or in the subordinate part what it means that a subject set is mapped from an object set by a Model_Element_Set_Mapping. If a subject set and an object set consist of ontology_atomic_constructs, intuitively, they should be interpreted disjunctively. If they consist of ontology_component, intuitively, they should be interpreted conjunctively. If they consist of entity_types, how they should be interpreted? If they consist of processes without dependencies, how they should be interpreted, they are in parallel or in any order? Unless all these kind of things are defined, Model_Element_Set_Mapping makes little sense.		
JP 09	(description)	8.5 Model_Element_Set_Mapping_Type		te	It is too ambiguous. Needs more specific description.		
JP 10		8.7 Model_Element_Set_Mapping_Degree		te	The meaning of each value needs to be clearly specified.		
JP 11		Annex B	Figure B-1	ed	It should be Figure B.1 to be consistent with ISO_IEC_Directives_Part_2. Similar comments are applicable to all figures and tables in Annex.		
JP 12		Annex B	Figure B-3 Object1101	te	"(name)" should be "name" because it is defined in this part.		
JP 13		Annex B	Figure B-3	ed	"expressed_model" should be "describes".		

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
			Object1101				
JP 14		Annex B	Figure B-3 Object1102	te	"(identifier)" should be "identifier" because it is defined in this part.		
JP 15		Annex B	Figure B-3 Object1102	ed	The value of "identifier" has to be globally unique. "Product Supplier Model A" is hardly globally unique.		
JP 16		Annex B	Figure B-3 Object1102	ed	"describing_language" should be "described_by". "model_element" should be "contains".		
JP 17		Annex B	Figure B-3 Object1103 etc.	ed	"containing_model" should be "contained_by".		
JP 18		Annex B	Figure B-4 Object1201	te	"(name)" should be "name" because it is defined in this part.		
JP 19		Annex B	Figure B-4 Object1201	ed	"expressed_model" should be "describes".		
JP 20		Annex B	Figure B-4 Object1202	te	"(identifier)" should be "identifier" because it is defined in this part.		
JP 21		Annex B	Figure B-4 Object1202	ed	The value of "identifier" has to be globally unique. "Product Supplier Model B" is hardly globally unique.		
JP 22		Annex B	Figure B-4 Object1202	ed	"describing_language" should be "described_by". "model_element" should be "contains".		
JP 23		Annex B	Figure B-4 Object1203 etc.	ed	"containing_model" should be "contained_by".		
JP 24		Annex B	Figure B-4 Object1304	te	"(label)" and their values should be removed.		

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
			Object1308				
JP 25		Annex B	Figure B-8 Object2101	te	"(name)" should be "name" because it is defined in this part.		
JP 26		Annex B	Figure B-8 Object2101	ed	"expressed_model" should be "describes".		
JP 27		Annex B	Figure B-8 Object2102	te	"(identifier)" should be "identifier" because it is defined in this part.		
JP 28		Annex B	Figure B-8 Objec2102	ed	The value of "identifier" has to be globally unique. "Order Placement Model C" is hardly globally unique.		
JP 29		Annex B	Figure B-8 Object2102	ed	"describing_language" should be "described_by". "model_element" should be "contains".		
JP 30		Annex B	Figure B-8 Object2103 etc.	ed	"containing_model" should be "contained_by".		
JP 31		Annex B	Figure B-9 Object2201	te	"(name)" should be "name" because it is defined in this part.		
JP 32		Annex B	Figure B-9 Object2201	ed	"expressed_model" should be "describes".		
JP 33		Annex B	Figure B-9 Object2202	te	"(identifier)" should be "identifier" because it is defined in this part.		
JP 34		Annex B	Figure B-9 Objec2202	ed	The value of "identifier" has to be globally unique. "Order Placement Model D" is hardly globally unique.		
JP 35		Annex B	Figure B-9 Object2202	ed	"describing_language" should be "described_by". "model_element" should be "contains".		

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
JP 36		Annex B	Figure B-9 Object2203 etc.	ed	"containing_model" should be "contained_by".		
JP 37		Annex B	Figure B-13 Object3101	te	"(name)" should be "name" because it is defined in this part.		
JP 38		Annex B	Figure B-13 Object3101	ed	"expressed_model" should be "describes".		
JP 39		Annex B	Figure B-13 Object3102	te	"(identifier)" should be "identifier" because it is defined in this part.		
JP 40		Annex B	Figure B-13 Objec3102	ed	The value of "identifier" has to be globally unique. "Handle Order Model E" is hardly globally unique.		
JP 41		Annex B	Figure B-13 Object3102	ed	"describing_language" should be "described_by". "model_element" should be "contains".		
JP 42		Annex B	Figure B-13 Object3103 etc.	ed	"containing_model" should be "contained_by".		
JP 43		Annex B	Figure B-23 Object4101	te	"(name)" should be "name" because it is defined in this part.		
JP 44		Annex B	Figure B-23 Object4101	ed	"expressed_model" should be "describes".		
JP 45		Annex B	Figure B-23 Object4102	te	"(identifier)" should be "identifier" because it is defined in this part.		
JP 46		Annex B	Figure B-23 Object4102	ed	"describing_language" should be "described_by". "model_element" should be "contains".		
JP 47		Annex B	Figure B-23	ed	It should be noted that the values of "model_element" are not exhaustive.		

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
			Object4102				
JP 48		Annex B	Figure B-23 Object4103 etc.	ed	"containing_model" should be "contained_by".		
JP 49		Annex B	Figure B-24 Object4201	te	"(identifier)" should be "identifer" because it is defined in this part.		
JP 50		Annex B	Figure B-24 Object4201	ed	"describing_language" should be "described_by". "model_element" should be "contains".		
JP 51		Annex B	Figure B-24 Object4101	ed	It should be noted that the values of "model_element" are not exhaustive.		
JP 52		Annex B	Figure B-24 Object4202 etc.	ed	"containing_model" should be "contained_by".		

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2 April 2013

Document: ISO/IEC CD2 19763-10

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
GB 01	Introduction	Para 2, line 3	ed	"... for registering for registering ..." - duplication	Remove one of the instances of "... for registering ..."	
GB 02	1	Para 3	ed	"... metemodel ..." – incorrect spelling	Amend to read "... metamodel ..."	
GB 03	5.1	Para 2, line 3	ed	"... basic mapping model allows the registration ..." – missing word	Amend to read "... basic mapping model which allows the registration ..."	
GB 04	5.2	Penultimate para	te	"Each model element uses zero, one or more other model elements. Each model element is used by zero, one or more other model elements." This implies a recursive association on Model_Element which is not shown in Fig 3.	Add recursive association to Fig 3.	
GB 05	Annex A	Last para	ed	"Instances of Model_Element_Set_Mapping_Type are examples of instances which may not instances of Identified_Item ." – missing word	Amend to read "Instances of Model_Element_Set_Mapping_Type are examples of instances which may not be instances of Identified_Item ."	
GB 06	Annex B		te	Examples 1 and 2 are not consistent with CD2 19763-12 – no objects corresponding to the Diagram metaclass are included.	Add Diagram objects to Examples 1 and 2	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2013-03-17	Document: 32N2301T	Project: CD2 19763-10
------------------	---------------------------	------------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
US-01		Introduction	2	ed	The phrase "for registering" occurs twice.	Remove one occurrence.	
US-02		1 Scope	3	ed	The word "metemodell" is misspelled.	Change to "Metamodel."	
US-03		1 Scope	Figure 1	ed	"specifie" occurs repeatedly.	Change to "specifies."	
US-04		5.1	Para 2	ed	Last sentence ungrammatical.	Replace "allows" with "to allow."	
US-05		B.1	Para 5, Sentence 3	ed	"reference" should be plural.	Replace with "references."	
US-06		Throughout		te	Use of term meta-class is confusing and not consistent with UML. The part specifies a model represented in UML. UML describes classes.	Use class instead.	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial